

Studies reviewed in developing REA requirements

Below is a table with the bibliographies of studies reviewed in developing the Renewable Energy Approval as part of O.Reg 359/09 (leading up to September 2009 — date of REA regulation promulgation). These are studies that were collected by Ministry staff, that were available around the world, and which were provided to the Ministry throughout the REA consultation process. Where available, web links to documents have been provided.

The ministry has a process in place to review emerging scientific and engineering studies, which will ensure we continue to keep up to date on the latest available research.

PIBS 8416e01

Studies

11th International Meeting on Low Frequency Noise and Vibration and its Control, van den Berg, G.P., Maastricht, The Netherlands, 30 Aug. to 1 Sept. 2004

http://www.viewsofscotland.org/library/docs/LF_turbine_sound_Van_Den_Berg_Sep04.pdf

A New Electromagnetic Exposure Metric: High Frequency Voltage Transients Associated With Increased Cancer Incidence in Teachers in a California School, Milham, S., and Morgan, L.L., American Journal of Industrial Medicine, 2008

A New Explanation for Wind Turbine Whoosh - Wind Shear, Monitoring Reports, William Palmer P. Eng., paper presented at Third International Wind Turbine Noise Conference at Aalborg, Denmark, 2009

http://amherstislandwindinfo.com/palmer_wtn_conference_2009.pdf

A Review of Published research on Low Frequency Noise and Its Effects, Dr. Leventhall, G., et.al., Report prepared for Defra (U.K. Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs), May 2003.

http://westminsterresearch.wmin.ac.uk/4141/1/Benton_2003.pdf

Addressing Concerns with Wind Turbines and Human Health, Canadian Wind Energy Association (CanWEA), Apr. 2009

<http://www.canwea.ca/pdf/CanWEA%20-%20Addressing%20concerns%20with%20wind%20turbines%20and%20human%20health.pdf>

Acoustic Ecology Institute Special Report: Wind Energy Noise Impacts, The Acoustic Ecology Institute, June 2009

Additional Information Requirements for Wind Turbines (Environmental Impact Assessment requirements), Government of New Brunswick

<http://www.gnb.ca/0009/0377/0002/0001/0014-e.pdf>

Alberta Utilities Commission Rule 012 (Noise Control), Alberta Utilities Commission, March 2009

<http://www.auc.ab.ca/acts-regulations-and-auc-rules/rules/Documents/Rule012.pdf>

Amplitude Modulation of Wind Turbine Noise: A Review of Evidence, Bowdler, D., published in Institute of Acoustics Bulletin Vol. 33 no. 4, July/August 2008

<http://www.dickbowdler.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2010/03/AM-of-Wind-Turbines.pdf>

Arran Lake Wetlands Complex: a study of a sensitive wildlife habitat under threat, Stelling, K., The Friends of Arran Lake, Oct. 2008

http://www.gwag.ca/media/pdf/Arran_Lake_REPORT.pdf

Article R1334-33 in France's Code of Public Health (Code de la santé publique), The Government of French Republic, 2006

<http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr//affichCodeArticle.do?idArticle=LEGIArtI000006910540&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006072665&dateTexte=20090929&fastPos=3&fastReqId=151755942&oldAction=rechCodeArticle>

Studies

Assessing the Environmental Capacity for On-Shore Wind Energy Development, Consultation on Proposed Approach to Natural England Guidance (Wind Energy Guidance Consultation), Natural England, 2009

http://www.naturalengland.org.uk/Images/windenergy-consultation_tcm6-12082.pdf

Baseline Environmental Sound Levels for Wind Turbine Projects, Hessler, G.F., and Hessler, D.M., Hymarket, Virginia, published in Sound and Vibration, November 2006

<http://www.sandv.com/downloads/0611hess.pdf>

British Columbia Land Use Operational Policy for Wind Power Projects, BC Ministry of Agriculture and Lands

http://www.agf.gov.bc.ca/clad/tenure_programs/programs/wind-power/index.html

Calculating the Real Cost of Industrial Wind Power: An information update for Ontario electricity consumers, Stelling, K., Friends of Arran Lake Wind Action Group, 2007

http://docs.wind-watch.org/wind_cost_report.pdf

California Guidelines for Reducing Impacts to Birds and Bats from Wind Energy Development: Commission Final Report, California Energy Commission, Oct. 2007

<http://www.energy.ca.gov/2007publications/CEC-700-2007-008/CEC-700-2007-008-CMF.PDF>

Contemporary Problems in Appropriate Technology: Residential Wind Turbines and Noise Emissions, Hodgson, E.V.F 2004

<http://www.wind.appstate.edu/reports/ResidentialWindTurbine-andNoiseEmissions.pdf>

Context and Opinion related to the Health Effects of Noise Generated by Wind Turbines, Agence Francaise de Securite Sanitaire de l'environnement et du Travail, 2006

<http://www.canwea.ca/pdf/talkwind/Afsett%20-%20Context%20and%20opinion%20related%20to%20health%20effects%20of%20noise%20generated%20by%20WT.pdf>

Denmark's Wind Planning Circular, available in Danish at:

http://www.blst.dk/Landsplan/Vindmoeller/Cirkulaere_og_vejledning_om_vindmoeller/

Deputation to the Ontario Standing Committee on General Government Regarding Bill C-150, Dr. McMurtry, R., April 22, 2009

Dirty Electricity Elevates Blood Sugar Among Electrically Sensitive Diabetics and May Explain Brittle Diabetes, Havas, M., published in Electromagnetic Biology and Medicine, Vol. 27, pages 135-146, 2008

Development of Regulatory Requirements for Wind Turbines in Alberta, DeGagne, D.C., and A. Lewis, A., Alberta Energy and Utilities Board, published in the Journal of the Canadian Acoustical Association, Vol.34, no. 2, June 2006

Dirty Electricity and invisible pollutant in schools, Havas, M., published in OSSTF/FEESO Education Forum Vol. 32, Issue 3, Fall 2006

Studies

Draft Model Wind Ordinance for Wisconsin, State of Wisconsin, Feb. 2007

Draft standard DZ6808 v.2.5, New Zealand Standards, Feb. 2000
<http://www.standards.co.nz/web-shop/?action=viewDraft&draftId=DZ6808&mod=drafts>

Effect of the wind profile at night on wind turbine sound. van den Berg, G.P., published in the Journal of Sound and Vibration, Vol. 277, no.4, 2004

Electromagnetic Hypersensitivity: Biological Effects of Dirty Electricity with Emphasis on Diabetes and Multiple Sclerosis, Havas, M., published in Electromagnetic Biology and Medicine, Vol. 35, pages 259-268, 2006.

http://www.next-up.org/pdf/Magda_Havas_EHS_Biological_Effets_Electricity_EmpHASis_Diabetes_Multiple_Sclerosis.pdf

Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999 (EPBC Act), Government of Australia

Environmental Noise from Wind Turbines, Howe, B., HGC Engineering, submitted to Ontario Ministry of the Environment for March 11th 2009 Technical Workshop on Renewable Energy Technologies

Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, New South Wales, Australia

First International Meeting on Wind Turbine Noise: Perspectives for Control, Berlin, Germany, 17-18 October 2005

http://www.iag.uni-stuttgart.de/luftfahrzeugaerodynamik/paper/wind_turbine_noise_10_2005_paper_lutz.pdf

Going Green for Less: Cost-Effective Alternative Energy Sources, Samson, R., Stamler, S.B., C.D. Howe Institute, Feb. 2009

Government statement regarding the findings of the Salford University report into Aerodynamic Modulation of Wind Turbine Noise, Government of the United Kingdom, 2007

Guidelines for Community Noise, WHO Report, edited by Berglund et al., 2000

Guide De L'étude D'impact Sur L'environnement Des Parcs Eoliens (Guide To The Study Of Environmental Impact Of Wind Farms), French Ministry of Ecology and Sustainable Development and Agency for Environment and Energy Management, 2004
http://www.ecologie.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_eolien.pdf

Health, Safety and Nuisance Concerns Associated with Wind Energy Development, report prepared by Jacques Whitford for Epcor Utilities Inc., Nov. 2006

Human response to Wind Turbine Noise, perception, annoyance and moderating factors, Pedersen E, Occupational and Environmental Medicine, Department of Public Health and Community Medicine, the Sahlgrenska Academy, Göteborgs Universitet, Göteborg, 2007

IEC 61400-11. Wind Turbine Generator Systems Part 11: Acoustic Noise Measurement Techniques, International Electrotechnical Commission, 2002

Impact of Wind Farms on the Value of Residential Property and Agricultural Land: An RICS Survey, Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors

Studies

Infrasound from Wind turbines: Fact, Fiction or Deception, Dr. Leventhal, G., Canadian Acoustics, Vol. 34 No. 2, 2006 https://www.cleanenergycouncil.org.au/cec/technologies/wind/turbinefactsheets/mainColumnParagraphs/0/text_files/file1/06-06Leventhal-Infras-WT-CanAcoustics2.pdf

ISO 9613-2 International Standard: Acoustics - Attenuation of sound during propagation outdoors, International Organization for Standardization

http://www.iso.org/iso/catalogue_detail.htm?csnumber=20649

Less for More: The Rube Goldberg Nature of Industrial Wind Development, Boone, J., Dec. 2006

<http://www.stopillwind.org/downloads/LessForMore.pdf>

Letter to Delaware Public Service Commission (Regarding PSC Docket 07-20), Kempton, W., and Levy, J., May 2007

Literature Search on the Potential Health Impacts Associated with Wind-to-Energy Turbine Operations: Summary Report, Ohio Department of Health, March 2008

<http://www.odh.ohio.gov/ASSETS/C43A4CD6C24B4F8493CB32D-525FB7C27/Wind%20Turbine%20SUMMARY%20REPORT.pdf>

Location, Location, Location: An investigation into wind farms and noise, Stewart, J., the UK Noise Association, July 2006

<http://www.countryguardian.net/Location.pdf>

Microseismic and Infrasound Monitoring of Low Frequency Noise and Vibrations from Windfarms, Styles, P., et. al., Keele University, Applied and Environmental Geophysics Research Group, July, 2005

Minnesota Administrative Rules Chapter 7854, Site Permit: Large Wind Energy System, State of Minnesota, Public Utilities Commission

<https://www.revisor.leg.state.mn.us/rules/?id=7854>

MN PUC Order: Establishing General Permit Standards, Minnesota, Public Utilities Commission, 2008 <http://energyfacilities.puc.state.mn.us/documents/19302/PUC%20Order%20Standards%20and%20Setbacks.pdf>

Model Wind Turbine Provisions and Best Practices for New Brunswick Municipalities, Rural Communities and Unincorporated Areas, New Brunswick Department of Energy, 2008 (prepared by Jacques Whitford)

<http://www.gnb.ca/0085/pdf/NBwindEnergy.pdf>

Landscape Integration and Harmonization Assessment Guide: Wind Farm Siting Project on Public Land, Quebec Ministry of Natural Resources and Fauna, 2008

<http://www.mrnf.gouv.qc.ca/english/publications/territory/program/eolien.pdf>

New Zealand Standard Proposal, Wind Farm Noise, Standards New Zealand, Sept 2009

Night Noise Guidelines for Europe; World Health Organization, 2009

Nocebo-Dysthymia Effect, Dahlstroem, W., Helix Synergy Inc., July 2009

Noise Radiation from Wind Turbines Installed Near Homes: Effects on Health with an annotated review of the research and related issues, Frey, B., and Hadden, P., 2007

Studies

Occupational and Community Noise: Fact Sheet No 258, World Health Organization, 2001

http://www.who.int/peh/Occupational_health/OCHweb/OSHpages/OSHDocuments/Factsheets/noise.pdf

Ontario Study Report, James, R.R., E-coustic Solutions, prepared for The Alliance to Protect Prince Edward County (APPEC)

Peer Review of "Recommendations for Risk Assessments of Ice Throw and Blade Failure in Ontario," Senes Consultants Limited, prepared for Ontario Ministry of the Environment, July 2009

Perception and annoyance due to wind turbine noise: A dose-response relationship, Pedersen E., and Waye, K.P., published in the Journal of Acoustic Society of America Vol. 116 No. 6, pages 3460-3470, Dec. 2004

<http://www.mfe.govt.nz/rma/call-in-turitea/submissions/186changeappendix6.pdf>

Permitting Setback Requirements for Wind Turbines in California, Public Interest Energy Research Interim Project Report, Prepared by California Wind Energy Collaborative for California Energy Commission, Nov. 2006

<http://www.energy.ca.gov/2005publications/CEC-500-2005-184/CEC-500-2005-184.PDF>

Permitting Setbacks for Wind Turbines in California, a report by the Public Interest Energy Research PIER program of the California Energy Commission, 2006 http://www.energy.ca.gov/pier/project_reports/CEC-500-2005-184.html

Power quality affects teacher wellbeing and student behaviour in three Minnesota Schools, Havas, M., and Olstad, A., the Science of the Total Environment, 2008

Planning Policy Statement 22: Renewable Energy, UK Department of Communities and Local Government, 2004 <http://www.communities.gov.uk/documents/planningandbuilding/pdf/147444.pdf>

Power Quality and Ground Current Issues to consider in addition to Noise and Infra-Sound, Havas, M., submitted to Ontario Ministry of the Environment for March 11th 2009 Technical Workshop on Renewable Energy Technologies

Pre-Filed Testimony of Jerry G. Lilly before the State of Washington Energy Facility Site Evaluation Council

Presentation to the Main Medical Association: Dr. Michael A. Nissenbaum, Case Series

Procedure for the assessment of low frequency noise complaints, Dr. Moorhouse, A., Dr. Waddington, D., and Dr. Adams, M., Acoustic Research Centre, University of Salford, United Kingdom, February 2005

<http://www.defra.gov.uk/environment/quality/noise/research/low-frequency/documents/nanr45-procedure.pdf>

Proceedings Wind Turbine Noise, Second International Conference on Wind Turbine Noise, Lyon, September 20-21, 2007

Public health effects of wind turbines, Minnesota State Department of Health, May 2009

<http://www.health.state.mn.us/divs/eh/hazardous/topics/windturbines.pdf>

Studies

Public Health Impacts of Wind Turbines, Minnesota Department of Health, Environmental Health Division, in response to request from Minnesota Department of Commerce, Office of Energy Security, May, 2009

<http://energyfacilities.puc.state.mn.us/documents/Public%20Health%20Impacts%20of%20Wind%20Turbines,%205.22.09%20Revised.pdf>

Recommendations for Risk Assessments of Ice Throw and Blade Failure in Ontario, prepared for CanWEA, Garrad Hassan Canada Inc., May 2007

Regional Decree 135/1989 Technical conditions to be met by issuing activities noises or vibrations, prepared by Navarra for Departamento de Medio Ambiente, Ordenación del Territorio y Vivienda, available in Spanish

<http://www.navarra.es/NR/rdonlyres/720868A7-3313-407D-A3E1-EE076384EC90/64825/D.PDF>

Renewable Energy Essentials: Wind, International Energy Agency, 2008

Repercussions of the Operation of Wind Turbines on Human Health, National Academy of Medicine of France, March 2006

Riverside County General Plan: Noise Element (Chapter 7), the County of Riverside Transportation and Land Management Agency, California, 2003

<http://www.rctlma.org/genplan/content/gp.aspx>

Research into Aerodynamic Modulation of Wind Turbine Noise: Final Report, Dr. Moorhouse, A., et. al., 2007

<http://www.berr.gov.uk/files/file40570.pdf>

Response to noise from modern wind farms in the Netherlands, Pedersen, E., van der Berg, F., Bakker, R., and Bouma J., published in Acoustical Society of America, Vol. 126, No.2 pages 634-643, 2009

Risk Analysis of Ice Throw from Wind Turbines, Sifert et al., paper presented at BOREAS 6, April 9-11, 2003, Pyha, Finland

<http://www.njwind.com/lempster/pdf/SEC%20Docs/24.%20Risk%20Analysis%20of%20Ice%20Throw%20-%20Seifert%20-%202003%20and%201998%20Papers.pdf>

Royal Decree 1367/2007, regarding noise zoning, quality targets and noise, Government of Spain, Department of Energy, 2007

<http://www.boe.es/boe/dias/2007/10/23/pdfs/A42952-42973.pdf>

Self reporting survey of Ontario individuals reporting adverse health effects from exposure to industrial wind turbines, Wind Vigilance for Ontario Victims, WindVOiCe

Setbacks to Wind Turbines in Ontario: An Engineering Justification Based on Public Safety Risk and Ontario Noise Regulations, William Palmer, Aug. 2006

Simple guidelines for siting wind turbines to prevent health risks, Kamperman, G.W., and James, R.R., July 2008

<http://www.wind-watch.org/documents/wp-content/uploads/simple-guidelines-for-siting-wind-turbines-to-prevent-health-risks.pdf>

Studies

Sleep disturbance and wind turbine noise, Dr. Hanning, C., on behalf of the Stop Swinford Wind Farm Action Group, June 2009
<http://www.wind-watch.org/documents/wp-content/uploads/Hanning-sleep-disturbance-wind-turbine-noise.pdf>

Some health aspects of wind driven industrial turbines, Archives and Collections Society, Picton, Ontario, March 2004
http://www.aandc.org/research/wind_community_health.html

Statement from Dr. David Manley

Développement durable de l'énergie éolienne: Considérations en matière de sécurité publique (Sustainable Development of Wind Energy: Consideration of Public Security), Government of Quebec
http://www.mamrot.gouv.qc.ca/pub/amenagement_territoire/orientations_gouvernementales/eoliennes_f04_considerations_securite.pdf

Technical directive for wind turbine setback. Hydro One

Technical Instruction for the Protection Against Noise, German Standard, 1998, available in German
<http://www.dfld.de/Link.php?URL=Archiv/TALaerm/TALaerm.htm>

The assessment and rating of noise from wind farms, UK Department for Business, Enterprise and Regulatory Reform, 1996
<http://www.berr.gov.uk/energy/sources/renewables/explained/wind/onshore-offshore/page21743.html>

The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), State of California
<http://ceres.ca.gov/ceqa/>

The Effect of Wind Development on Local Property Values, Sterzinger, G., Beck, F., and Kostiuk, D., Renewable Energy Policy Project, May 2003

The Health Impact of Wind Turbines: A Review of the Current White, Grey, and Published Literature, Chatham-Kent Public Health Unit, June 2008

<http://www.wind-works.org/LargeTurbines/Health%20and%20Wind%20by%20C-K%20Health%20Unit.pdf>

The measurement of low frequency noise at three UK wind farms, McKenzie, H., 2006

<http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20091002233416/http://www.berr.gov.uk/files/file31270.pdf>

The New Brunswick Developer's Guide to Renewable Energy, Government of New Brunswick http://www.gnb.ca/0085/pdf/Developers_Guide_E.pdf

The Sounds of High Winds: the effect of atmospheric stability on wind turbine sound and microphone noise. van den Berg, G.P., Doctoral dissertation, University of Groningen, Netherlands, May 2006.

Towers, Turbines, Power Lines, and Buildings: Steps being taken by the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to Avoid or Minimize Take of Migratory Birds at These Structures, Manville, A. M., Proceedings 4th International Partners in Flight Conference, McAllen, TX. February 2008.

Tuning and sensitivity of the human vestibular system to low frequency vibration. Todd et al., published in Neuroscience Letters Vol. 444, 2008, pages 36-41.

Studies

West Saxony Regional Plan (2008) found in German at
<http://www.rpv-westsachsen.de>

What is the impact of wind farms on house prices?, Findings in Built and Rural Environments. Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors, March 2007

WI AB 256/SB 185, Uniform Siting Standards for Small Wind Farms, State of Wisconsin, 2009

<http://www.wmc.org/governmentaffairs/display.cfm?ID=269>

Wind Chill: Why wind energy will not fill the UK's energy gap. Lodge, T., Centre for Policy Studies, 2008

Wind Energy Guide, French Environment and Energy Management Agency (ADEME)

Wind Energy Policy in Denmark: 25 Years of Success – What Now?
Krohn, S., Danish Wind Industry Association, Feb. 2002 [http://guidedtour.windpower.org/media\(493,1033\)/Wind_energy_policy_in_Denmark%3A_25_years_of_success_-_what_now%3F.pdf](http://guidedtour.windpower.org/media(493,1033)/Wind_energy_policy_in_Denmark%3A_25_years_of_success_-_what_now%3F.pdf)

Wind Farms Environmental Noise Guidelines, South Australia, Environmental protection Act, July 2009

Wind Farm Industry Policy Statement, Ministry of Environment, Heritage and the Arts of New South Wales, Australia. July 2009.

Wind Power in Denmark: technology, policies and results, Sept. 1999

Wind Siting Act, Statue 216F, State of Minnesota
<https://www.revisor.leg.state.mn.us/statutes/?id=216F>

Wind Turbine Acoustic Noise, A White Paper, Dr. Rodgers, A., Renewable Energy Research Laboratory Department of Mechanical and Industrial Engineering, University of Massachusetts at Amherst, June 2002 amended January 2006

<http://www.minutemanwind.com/pdf/Understanding%20Wind%20Turbine%20Acoustic%20Noise.pdf>

Wind Turbine Facilities Noise Issues, Acoustic Consulting Report, prepared for the Ontario Ministry of Environment by Dr. Ramakrishnan, R., (Lead Acoustician), December 28 2007.

Wind Turbine Fire Protection Guidelines, Innisfil Alternative Energy Ad Hoc Advisory Committee, July 2008

Wind turbine noise, annoyance and self-reported health and well-being in different living environments, Pedersen E, and Waye. K.P., 2007

<http://oem.bmjjournals.org/content/64/7/480.abstract>

Wind Turbine Syndrome: Testimony before the New York State Legislature Energy Committee, Dr. Pierpont, N., MD, PhD, March, 2006

<http://www.windturbinesyndrome.com>

Wind Turbines: Low level noise sources interfering with restoration?
Pedersen E., and Waye, K.P. K., Environmental Research Letters 3, January-March 2008

Studies

Wind Turbines and Environmental Assessment. Ray Copes, R., and Rideout, K., presented to Western Medical Officers of Health Meeting June 23, 2009, Banff, AB., National Collaborating Centre for Environmental Health
http://www.ncceh.ca/files/Western_MOH_2009_Wind_Turbines.pdf

Wind Turbines and Industrial Sources, Keith, S., et al., presented to Health Canada, Consumer and Clinical Radiation Protection Bureau, March 11, 2009

Wind Turbines and Infrasound, Howe, B., HGC Engineering, submitted to CanWEA, November 2006

http://canwea.ca/images/uploads/File/CanWEA_Wind_Turbine_Sound_Study_-_Final.pdf

Wind Turbines and Sound: Review and Best Practice Guidelines. HGC Engineering. Submitted to CanWEA, February 2007

Wind Turbines Make Waves: Why do some resident near wind turbines get sick? Dr. Havas, M., Trent University. Presentation to Florence, Ontario Township Council, Nov. 2008

Wind Turbines, Noise and Health, Dr. Harry, A., Feb 2007

WINDFARM perception: Visual and Acoustic Impact of Wind Turbine Farms on Residents; Final report; Frits van den Berg, F., Petersen, E., Bouma, J., and Bakker R., University of Gothenburg, June 3, 2008

http://www.ontario-sea.org/Storage/32/2348_Visual_and_acoustic_impact_of_wind_turbine_farms_on_residents.pdf

World Wind Energy Report 2008, World Wind Energy Association, 2008.

Environmental Impacts of Wind-Energy Projects, National Research Council (NRC), Washington D.C., 2007

Safe Environs Program, Health Canada Environmental Assessment Nova Scotia. August 6, 2009
